

OFFICE OF THE FIRST APPELLATE AUTHORITY
(Appointed under the Right to Information Act, 2005)
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India ICSI House
C-36, Sector-62, Institutional Area
Noida - 201 309 (U.P.)

Appeal No.00069/2024

IN THE MATTER OF:

Shri Ayush Gupta
Anupam Medical Stores, Korba Road,
Baloda, Pin – 495559, Chattisgarh

Appellant

Vs.

Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi - 110003

Respondent

Date of Order: 15th June, 2024

ORDER

- (1) The Appellant has filed first Appeal- No. ICSOI/A/E/24/00069 on 18.05.2024 under Section 19(1) of the Right to Information Act, 2005 in connection with Response vide letter dated 02.05.2024 against the Central Public Information Officer (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India.
- (2) The Appellant vide his RTI Application No. ICSOI/R/E/24/08004 dated 22.04.2024 has requested to provide information as per his following queries:
 - a) Is it allowed for All India Rankers of Executive and Professional to attend convocation? If yes, then in convocation what things All India Rankers get in Convocation?
 - b) What is the prize money for All India Rankers of Executive and Professional? Kindly provide details of prize money of each Ranks from AIR 1 to AIR 10.
 - c) What are the prizes, trophies and Certificates and medals awarded by ICSI for All India Rankers for Executive and Professional programmes? Kindly provide details and names of all the prizes, trophies and medal whether Gold, Silver or Bronze for AIR 1 to AIR10.
 - d) Why the MoU between ICSI and IGNOU ends for B.COM. and M.COM. ? Is ICSI planning for such MoU for CS students will come in coming future in 2-3 years?
- (3) The Appellant has submitted in the instant appeal that the response provided by the Respondent is incomplete as follows:
 - a) In the first question, I had asked "what things All India Rankers gets in the convocation?". Answer to this question is not provided.
 - b) In the second question, I had asked "What is the prize money for All India Rankers of

Executive and Professional? Kindly provide details of prize money of each Ranks from AIR 1 to AIR 10." Only the pdf is provided regarding scholarship but regarding Prize money amount of ALL India Rankers no information is provided.

- c) In the third question I had asked "What are the prizes, trophies and Certificates and medals awarded by ICSI for All India Rankers for Executive and Professional programmes? Kindly provide details and names of all the prizes, trophies and medal whether Gold, Silver or Bronze for AIR 1 to AIR 10." But pdf provided in the reply is only about scholarship and eligibility. No information regarding trophies, certificates and medal name is provided there.
- d) Only the fourth question, Reply is provided correctly.

(4) The reply of the Respondent against the instant appeal is as under: -

"Since the RTI application pertains to the Directorate of Examination of the ICSI, therefore, the CPIO has asked for written submission from the concerned Directorate for the same. Their submission is mentioned below:

Written submission to query number 1: Our reply remains the same as provided vide RTI reply dated 02.05.2024. Further, the ICSI Convocation Guidelines 2023 are attached herewith as Annexure-I.

Written submission to query number 2: The query, although interrogative in nature was appropriately replied vide RTI Reply dated 02.05.2024.

Further, the Prize money is provided to Prize Award winners who may not necessarily be All-India Rankers. All India Rankers who are not Prize Award winners are given only a "Certificate of Merit".

Written submission to query number 3: The information was provided to the Appellant vide RTI Reply dated 02.05.2024. The appellant was informed that All India Rankers are provided "Certificates of Merit".

Further, the details about prizes was also provided to the Appellant.

The Public Authority under the RTI Act 2005 is not supposed to create information or to interpret information or to solve the problems raised by the applicants.

Therefore, the contents made in the RTI Reply stands as it is and the appeal deserves to be dismissed."

- (5) This Office has carefully considered the application, the response, the appeal and the records made available and finds that the matter can be decided based on the material available on record.

The Appellant has submitted in his appeal that there are four queries in his RTI application out of which Respondent has answered 4th query correctly. This office has the following views on the submissions of the Appellant in respect of the remaining queries in his instant appeal based on the justifications provided by the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal:

For Query No. 1: This office concurs with the reply of the Respondent dated 02.05.2024 to this RTI query.

For Query No. 2 & 3: This office concurs with the submissions of the Respondent in his reply to the instant appeal.

The appeal is accordingly disposed of.

Sd/-

(Asit Kumar Rath)
First Appellate Authority

Copy to:

1. Shri Ayush Gupta
Anupam Medical Stores, Korba Road,
Baloda, Pin – 495559, Chattisgarh
2. Central Public Information Officer
The Institute of Company Secretaries of India
'ICSI House', 22, Institutional Area, Lodi Road,
New Delhi - 110003
3. Directorate of IT - For publishing on the website